



Historic England

WEST MIDLANDS OFFICE

Mr James Latham  
Herefordshire Council  
Neighbourhood Planning & Strategic Planning  
Planning Services, PO Box 230, Blueschool House  
Blueschool Street  
Hereford  
HR1 2ZB

Direct Dial: 0121 625 6887

Our ref: PL00466965

20 August 2018

Dear Mr Latham

**MUCH MARCLE; HOPE UNDER DINMORE; BODENHAM AND YARKHILL  
NEIGHBOURHOOD PLANS- HRA CONSULTATIONS**

Thank you for your consultation and the invitation to comment on the HRA Documents for the above Neighbourhood Plans.

For the purposes of such consultations, Historic England confines its advice to the question, "Is it likely to have a significant effect on the environment?" in respect of our area of concern, cultural heritage.

In this context and regarding HRA Historic England does not disagree with your conclusions but is happy to defer to the opinions of the other statutory consultees. I trust the above comments will be of help in taking forward the Neighbourhood Plans

Yours sincerely,

Peter Boland  
Historic Places Advisor  
[peter.boland@HistoricEngland.org.uk](mailto:peter.boland@HistoricEngland.org.uk)

cc:



THE AXIS 10 HOLLIDAY STREET BIRMINGHAM B1 1TF

Telephone 0121 625 6870  
[HistoricEngland.org.uk](http://HistoricEngland.org.uk)



Date: 03 September 2018  
Our ref: 253817  
Your ref: None



James Latham  
Technical Support Officer  
Neighbourhood Planning and Strategic Planning teams  
Herefordshire Council  
[neighbourhoodplanning@herefordshire.gov.uk](mailto:neighbourhoodplanning@herefordshire.gov.uk)

**BY EMAIL ONLY**

Customer Services  
Hornbeam House  
Crewe Business Park  
Electra Way  
Crewe  
Cheshire  
CW1 6GJ

T 0300 060 3900

Dear Mr Latham,

**Hope under Dinmore and Newton Neighbourhood Development Plan Habitats Regulations Assessment (HRA) consultation**

Thank you for your consultation on the above dated 25 July 2018 which was received by Natural England on the same date.

Natural England is a non-departmental public body. Our statutory purpose is to ensure that the natural environment is conserved, enhanced, and managed for the benefit of present and future generations, thereby contributing to sustainable development.

We understand that the Habitat Regulations Assessment has been revisited in light of the recent judgement from the Court of Justice of the European Union, *People over Wind, Peter Sweetman v Coillte* ([Case C-323/17 People Over Wind v Coillte Teoranta](#)).

Natural England is currently considering the particular implications of the *People over Wind* judgment for its advice on neighbourhood planning and the basic condition that the making of the neighbourhood plan is not likely to have a significant effect on a European site (paragraph 1, Schedule 2 of the Neighbourhood Planning (General) Regulations 2012). We can offer more support and advice in the coming weeks as the implications of the judgement become clearer.

In the interim, we advise that local planning authorities, as competent authority for neighbourhood plans, should consider this judgment before relying on measures intended to avoid or reduce the harmful effects of the plan to screen out neighbourhood plans under the Conservation of Habitats and Species Regulations 2017. Local planning authorities may wish to take their own legal advice on the implications of the judgment.

The Hope under Dinmore and Newton Neighbourhood Development Plan sets out policies around the delivery of houses in the catchment of the River Wye Special Area of Conservation (SAC). The River Wye SAC currently suffers from water quality issues due to the effects of point and diffuse sources (which includes, but is not limited to waste water from mains and non-mains sewage, surface water run-off, road run-off, agricultural run-off and run-off from the urban environment), non-native invasive species, siltation and modifications to the river channel. In particular, levels of phosphate in parts of the River Wye SAC have exceeded the water quality objectives, whereas

other parts are at risk of not meeting them. Development within the catchments of the River Wye SAC have the potential to further contribute to the poor water quality and siltation levels of the River Wye as a result of surface and foul water entering the River Wye/Lugg and its tributaries.

There is a Nutrient Management Plan (NMP) for the River Wye SAC. The NMP tested a series of options and established that nutrient levels in the river could be reduced and targets could be met, while also accommodating the council's growth aspirations for the county. Mitigation was an integral part of plan-making for the Core Strategy, for example informing decisions on allocations and the phasing of development. The Core Strategy includes mitigation through policies on water quality and on safeguarding European sites. On this basis, the Core Strategy's Appropriate Assessment concluded that there were no Adverse Effects on Integrity, and we agreed that the plan was sound. However, there is further work to do in order to agree to and then implement set measures to reduce phosphate in the river. We consider that the work described above constitutes a 'strategic solution', elements of which are still to be decided.

The Core Strategy itself has been well-tested and complies with *People over Wind*. There is ongoing debate about whether lower tier plans (such as a neighbourhood plan) and projects require an appropriate assessment, as the strategic solution has already been tested thoroughly at the plan level. Given the risk of procedural challenge, it is our view that in these circumstances it would be prudent to carry out an appropriate assessment of the plan or project to assess the compliance with the higher tier plan. Due to the basic condition associated with neighbourhood plans this option is not currently available to them; therefore Neighbourhood Plans in this situation cannot proceed. Notwithstanding our advice the final decision on this rests with the competent authority and we therefore advise the council to seek its own legal advice on the extent to which you can rely on a higher-tier appropriate assessment.

The Hope under Dinmore and Newton NDP enables the delivery of houses and sets out policies governing their approximate location, form, delivery etc. We note that 22 of the 26 new houses required in the Much Marcle Neighbourhood Area have already been completed or committed to, and that only an additional 4 houses are required to meet the Core Strategy allocations. The small scale of the housing allocations does not mean that there are no likely significant effects. As the NMP informs the delivery of housing in the River Wye SAC catchment, there is a clear pathway for impacts.

Any development in the River Wye SAC relies upon the strategic solution for mitigation. The delivery of the NDP is therefore reliant upon mitigation and thus the conclusion of the HRA Screening can only be that there are likely significant effects. In addition, paragraph 4.22 describes the issues regarding nutrient levels in the River Wye SAC and policy *HUD3: Criteria for new housing development* sets out requirements regarding drainage, therefore providing mitigation. The NDP therefore does not comply with the basic condition that the making of the Neighbourhood Development Plan is not likely to have a significant effect on a European site, and cannot proceed.

We understand that the Ministry of Housing, Communities & Local Government is currently considering this basic condition in light of the *People over Wind* judgement. We therefore suggest that this Neighbourhood Development Plan is put on hold and that Herefordshire Council as the competent authority seeks an update on this.

We would be happy to comment further should the need arise but if in the meantime you have any queries please do not hesitate to contact us.

For any queries relating to the specific advice in this letter only please contact Hayley Fleming on 02080 260955. For any new consultations, or to provide further information on this consultation please send your correspondences to [consultations@naturalengland.org.uk](mailto:consultations@naturalengland.org.uk).

Yours sincerely

Hayley Fleming  
Casework Manager  
Planning for a Better Environment – West Midlands Area Team